Regulating Israeli and Palestinian Construction in Area C

May 2017
Team Members
Maj. Gen. (Res.) Amnon Reshef, CIS
Founder & Chairman; Project leader

Col. (Res.) Dr. Shaul Arieli, CIS
Member, Steering Committee; Senior Research Director

Boaz Karni, ECF
Co-Founder & CEO

Dr. Nimrod Novik, CIS
Member, Executive Committee & Steering Committee
Senior Associate, ECF
Israel Fellow, IPF

Arie Pellman, CIS
Member, Executive Committee & Steering Committee

Brig. Gen. (Res.) Dov Sedaka, CIS
Member
Senior Consultant, ECF
Former Head of Civil Administration in Gaza & the West Bank

Col. (Res.) Ron Shatzberg, ECF
Research Director

Maps
Shaul Rabinovich

Translation
Sam Shube

Design
Bukai-Shani Advertising
Limor Zamir
Eli Kowaz, IPF
Communications & Digital Director

© 2017 – All rights reserved – Commanders for Israel's Security (CIS)
# Table of Contents

General | Facts & Figures .................................................. 4  

The Central Idea: Specifics for Israel .................................. 6  

Specifics for the Palestinian Authority .................................. 14  

The Deir Ballut Example ................................................... 16  

Summary ........................................................................... 18  

List of Maps

Map 1: Division of Control in the West Bank ....................... 5  

Map 2: The Five Settlement Blocs ....................................... 7  

Map 3: Gush Etzion Bloc ....................................................... 8  

Map 4: The Ma’ale Adumim Bloc .......................................... 9  

Map 5: The Givat Ze’ev Bloc ................................................. 10  

Map 6: The Modi’in Illit Bloc ............................................... 11  

Map 7: The Western Samaria Bloc ....................................... 12  

Map 8: East Jerusalem .......................................................... 13  

Map 9: The Five Settlement Blocs &  
      The Extension of PA Authority to segments of Area C ...................... 15  

Aerial Photographs of Deir Ballut ....................................... 17
General
- The Trump administration has made public its aim of reaching a permanent status agreement between Israel and the Palestinians.
- As part of discussions aimed at restarting negotiations, we recommend that arrangements be put in place for regulating Israeli and Palestinian construction in the West Bank (Area C) so as to resolve respective housing shortages and satisfy the needs of natural growth.
- This outline offers two solutions – one for the Israeli side and one for the Palestinian – which together can serve both as a practical response to actual needs and as a confidence building measure.
- The outline has an additional advantage that serves the interests of both sides: it would extend Palestinian Authority (PA) governance over Palestinians residing in Area C.
- Furthermore, it would signal that Area C has not been excluded as a subject of future negotiations.

Facts & Figures
- The following facts and figures are relevant to the proposed ‘deal’:
  - The area of the West Bank is 5,842 sq. km. (including East Jerusalem and half of no-man’s-land).
  - 60% of the area of the West Bank is defined as Area C; 40% as Areas A and B.
  - As of 2016, some 413,000 Israelis and 2.3 million Palestinians live in the West Bank. In addition, 220,000 Israelis and 320,000 Palestinians reside in respectively Jewish and Arab neighborhoods in East Jerusalem.
  - There are 126 Jewish settlements in Area C (counting the Jewish settlement in Hebron). They include 4 cities, 13 towns (local councils), and 6 regional councils containing 109 settlements.
  - Areas A and B (which are respectively under full and partial Palestinian control) are essentially an archipelago containing 169 ‘islands’ of Palestinian cities and villages surrounded by Area C which is under Israeli control (see Map 1).
  - Since the signing of the interim agreement in 1995 and as Area B could no longer accommodate Palestinian natural growth, 20,000 housing units – home to some 250,000 Palestinians – have been built without permit in adjacent sections of Area C. Most of these houses have been built on privately owned Palestinian land. 12,500 of these housing units are subject to demolition warrants.
The Central Idea

- US diplomacy will formulate an agreement/understandings between the governments of Israel (GOI) and the Palestinian Authority (PA), to be based on the following principles:
  - On the Israeli side:
    Exceptions will be made to the settlement freeze so as to address natural growth in settlements containing some 73% of all Jews living over the Green Line without violating the principles governing the freeze, including no further disruption of the territorial contiguity of areas slated for future Palestinian sovereignty.
  - On the Palestinian side:
    The threat of home demolition will be removed from over 250,000 Palestinians residing in unauthorized housing units which have spilled over from saturated locations in Area B into Area C; space will be provided for further natural growth; and PA jurisdiction will be extended to those scattered neighborhoods.

Specifics:

For Israel

- As part of the settlement freeze, Israel will refrain from offering incentives or passing legislation or regulations that encourage Israelis to relocate from within the Green Line to the West Bank. It may, however, build within the 5 settlement blocks and East Jerusalem indicated on Maps 2 – 8, home to some 73% of all settlers living in the West Bank. Construction will be carried out in a manner that does not involve expropriation of additional land. Starting from the Effective Date (when US–Israeli aerial photographs establish an agreed point of departure), construction will be confined to the already built up area. With time, as the potential for construction is exhausted, Israel will consult with the US prior to expanding into the next construction zone as follows:
  - adjacent to the built-up area;
  - within the perimeter fence of the settlement;
  - adjacent to the fence;
  - within the block;
  - 500 meters from the boundary of the block;
- Israel will only build within the built-up area of the 12 Jewish neighborhoods in East Jerusalem indicated on map 8.

[Note: the area of the blocks shown below reflects the formal and informal ‘Zone of Possible Agreement’ (ZOPA) as it has evolved during the various rounds of I–P negotiations].
Size of the bloc: 42 sq.km.
Number of Jewish settlements: 9.
Built-up area: 5.6 sq.km.
Population: 75,817.

Legend
- The Green Line
- ZOPA Line
- Existing 'Security Fence'
- Planned 'Security Fence'
- Settlement Within a Bloc
- Palestinian Village

Division of Jurisdiction in the West Bank
- Area A
- Area B
- Area C
- Area C re-designated as B
- Road

Planned road for use by
- Palestinians - 'Dig and Cover'
- Palestinians - Tunnel
- Functional arrangement for Israeli traffic on Route 60
- Existing underground passage
- Proposed underground passage
Map 4: The Ma’ale Adumim Bloc

Size of the bloc: 10 sq.km.
Jewish settlement: the city of Ma’ale Adumim.
Built-up area: 3.4 sq.km.
Population: 40,836.

Legend
- Green Line: The Green Line
- ZOPA Line: ZOPA Line
- Purple: Jerusalem Mun. Boundary
- Red: Existing ‘Security Fence’
- Grey: Planned ‘Security Fence’
- Light Green: Hizme A-Zayyim Road
- Orange: E1
- Dark Blue: Settlement Within a Bloc
- Light Blue: Settlement Outside a Bloc
- Yellow: Palestinian Village
- Road: Road

Division of Jurisdiction in the West Bank
- Area A
- Area B
- Area C
- Area C re-designated as B
Map 5: The Givat Ze'ev Bloc

Size of the bloc: 11 sq.km.
Jewish settlements: 2.
Built-up area: 1.7 sq.km.

Legend

- The Green Line
- ZOPA Line
- Jerusalem Mun. Boundary
- Existing ‘Security Fence’
- Planned ‘Security Fence’
- Settlement Within a Bloc
- Settlement Outside a Bloc
- Palestinian Village
- Underground Passage
- Road

Division of Jurisdiction in the West Bank

- Area A
- Area B
- Area C
- Area C re-designated as B

RT 1
0 2.8 KM

RT 443

Bibbulmum

Givat Ze’ev
(Har Shamuel)

Givat Ze’ev

Givon
Hahadasha

Katana

Biddu

Beit Suriq

Ramat Shlomo

Ramat

El-Jib

Rafat

Atarot Industrial
Area

Beit Horon

Beit-Dakka

Har Adar

Beit Ikra

CIS©
Map 6: The Modi’in Illit Bloc

Size of the bloc: 14 sq.km.
Jewish settlements: 5.
Built-up area: 3.6 sq.km.
Population: 76,563.

Legend
- Green Line
- ZOPA Line
- Existing ‘Security Fence’
- Settlement Within a Bloc
- Palestinian Village

Division of Jurisdiction in the West Bank
- Orange: Area A
- Yellow: Area B
- White: Area C
- Light Green: Area C re-designated as B
- Road: Black Line
Map 7: The Western Samaria Bloc

Size of the bloc: 27 sq.km.
Jewish settlements: 5.
Built-up area: 4.6 sq.km.
Population: 29,008.

Legend
- The Green Line
- ZOPA Line
- Existing ‘Security Fence’
- Planned ‘Security Fence’
- Settlement Within a Bloc
- Palestinian Village
- Road

Division of Jurisdiction in the West Bank
- Area A
- Area B
- Area C
- Area C re-designated as B

CIS©
Size of area: 70 sq.km.
12 Jewish neighborhoods.
Built-up area: 11.2 sq.km.
Population: 220,000 Israelis.
320,000 Palestinians.
For the Palestinian Authority

- The challenge:
  - Over the past 20 years, natural growth has exceeded construction capacity in over 90 villages located in Area B, resulting in unauthorized construction in adjacent sections of Area C.
  - Well over 20,000 housing units, home to approx. 250,000 Palestinians, are involved.
  - For the most part, those houses are built on privately owned Palestinian plots.
  - Some 12,500 of these houses are subject to demolition warrants.
  - Over the years, some 3,300 houses have been demolished.

- The solution:
  - Expanding the perimeter of the Area B villages involved by 500 meters (into Area C) and re-designating those segments of Area C as Area B, thereby bringing them under PA authority; legalizing all 20,000 or so units; and allowing further natural growth needs to be met legally on Palestinian land.
  - For this to happen, Israel will re-designate the relevant sections of Areas C as B.
  - The total amount of land in question is 192 sq.km.
  - This represents 3.3% of the territory of the West Bank.
  - These areas contain unauthorized construction from 93 Palestinian villages.
  - For security reasons, and to avoid friction between the two communities, the above should not apply where the suggested solution comes closer than 500 meters from either the Security Barrier or the outer perimeter of a Jewish settlement.
  - All these factors were considered in mapping out these areas (see Map 9).

- Outcome:
  - Relieving the shortage of Palestinian housing.
  - Removing the threat of home demolition from 250,000 Palestinians.
  - Strengthening Palestinian governance and expanding the presence of Palestinian law enforcement in defined areas, without negatively affecting the security of Israel or of Israeli settlers.
  - Signaling that the current division of the West Bank into territory under exclusive Israeli control (Area C) and territory under full or partial Palestinian control (Areas A and B) is not final.
Map 9: The Five Settlement Blocs & The Extension of PA Authority to segments of Area C
The Deir Ballut Example:

Deir Ballut is a typical example of a Palestinian village in this category.

- Built-up area: 0.7 sq.km.
- Number of buildings in the village: 800
- Buildings served with demolition orders: 62.
- Re-designation of territory (within a 500 meter radius) from Area C to Area B: 2.7 sq.km.
- All the area in question is privately owned Palestinian land.
The problem: 210 buildings illegally constructed outside Area B.

The solution: Segments of Area C re-designated as Area B.
Summary

- Exceptions to the freeze on building in the settlements will be made for 22 Jewish settlements in the West Bank and 12 Jewish neighborhoods in East Jerusalem (home to 461,000 Israelis representing 73% of all Israelis living over the Green Line). Building will be carried out in successive order of priority in such a way as not to disrupt the potential for Palestinian territorial contiguity in a future agreement.

- The PA will be given authority and extend its jurisdiction over 192 sq.km. of land adjacent to 93 densely built-up villages, with an emphasis on law and order, planning, and zoning. This will save well over 20,000 homes containing 250,000 Palestinians from the threat of demolition, facilitate additional construction in these areas, and signal – even if only in a limited way – that the division of the West Bank into Areas A, B and C could change as part of a future agreement.
'Commanders for Israel’s Security' (CIS) is a non-partisan Movement. Its members are retired Generals and equivalents in Israel’s security services (the IDF, Israeli Security Agency, Mossad and Israel Police). Its members seek to promote no personal ambition. They are motivated solely by concern for the future of our country, our children and grandchildren.

The CIS took a decision to promote a security-political initiative that will extricate Israel from the current impasse as an interim step toward implementing its Vision.

The Movement’s Vision is centered around the need to reach a permanent agreement with the Palestinians; to normalize relations and enter into security arrangements with pragmatic Arab states; and thus to secure Israel within final, recognized boundaries while ensuring its identity as the democratic state of the Jewish People.